

Decision Maker: Education Budget Sub-Committee
Date: 2 May 2013
Decision Type: Non-Urgent Non-Executive Non-Key
Title: **POST COMPLETION REPORTS**
Contact Officer: Robert Bollen, CYP Strategic Property Manager
Tel: 020 8313 4697 E-mail: robert.bollen@bromley.gov.uk
Chief Officer: Terry Parkin, Executive Director, Education and Care Services
Ward: Boroughwide

1. Reason for report

As part of the Capital Programme Procedures it is a requirement that schemes should be formally reviewed within one year of completion and the outcome of this review be brought to the Portfolio Holder for endorsement.

2. **RECOMMENDATION(S)**

2.1 **That the Portfolio Holder endorses the findings of the Post Completion Reviews that have been carried out in respect of the:**

- expansion of Bickley Primary School by 210 pupils;
- expansion of Princes Plain Primary School by 105 pupils;
- rebuilding of The Highway Primary School.
- creation of the Hawes Down Centre in West Wickham to provide a specialist facility to deliver services for children and young people with additional needs and disabilities and their families.

Corporate Policy

1. Policy Status: Existing Policy: Further Details
 2. BBB Priority: Children and Young People: Further Details
-

Financial

1. Cost of proposal: No Cost
 2. Ongoing costs: Not Applicable
 3. Budget head/performance centre: Education Capital Programme
 4. Total current budget for this head: £
 5. Source of funding:
-

Staff

1. Number of staff (current and additional):
 2. If from existing staff resources, number of staff hours:
-

Legal

1. Legal Requirement: Non Statutory – Government Guidance
 2. Call-in: Applicable
-

Customer Impact

1. Estimated number of users/beneficiaries (current and projected):
-

Ward Councillor Views

1. Have Ward Councillors been asked for comments? No
2. Summary of Ward Councillors comments:

3. COMMENTARY

3.1 The Capital Programme Procedures require that a post completion review be carried out within 12 months of the completion of schemes that are included within the programme. This process is designed to determine the Authority's performance in the following key area:

- Were the original scheme objectives achieved?
- Were the scheme costs contained within the original budget?
- Did the scheme complete on time?
- What was the level of customer satisfaction from the end user with the overall process?

3.2 The information set out in the appendix shows the above information for the expansion of Bickley Primary School and Princes Plain Primary School, rebuilding of The Highway Primary School and the creation of the Hawes Down Centre.

4. POLICY IMPLICATIONS

4.1 One of the main aims of the Council's Asset Management Plan is to ensure that all the partners in the asset management planning processes are fully consulted on the process and its outcomes. Progression of the schemes at Bickley Primary School, Princes Plain Primary School, The Highway Primary School and the Hawes Down Centre contributed to ensuring sufficient school places and efficiency of organisation, a priority within the Council's Strategy "Building a Better Bromley" and contributes to the strategy to achieve the status of an Excellent Council. This policy also contributes to key targets within the Children and Young People Services Plan, particularly the outcome that "Children and young people are enabled and encouraged to attend and enjoy school".

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

5.1 This report provides information on a Post Completion Review that has been carried out in respect of building works at Bickley Primary School, Princes Plain Primary School, The Highway School and the Hawes Down Centre. There are no financial implications arising from the matters addressed in this report.

Non-Applicable Sections:	Personnel and Legal Implications
Background Documents: (Access via Contact Officer)	THE HIGHWAY PRIMARY SCHOOL: UPDATE REPORT - REFERENCE FROM CHILDREN AND YOUNG PEOPLE PDS COMMITTEE (Part 2) 7 March 2012 THE HIGHWAY PRIMARY SCHOOL CAPITAL SCHEME – UPDATE REPORT 2 (Part 2) 24 January 2012 THE HIGHWAY PRIMARY SCHOOL CAPITAL SCHEME – UPDATE REPORT 1 (Part 2) 14 July 2011 APPROVAL OF PROCUREMENT STRATEGY AND OUTLINE PROPOSAL FOR SCHEMES AT THREE PRIMARY SCHOOLS (Part 2) 31 March 2010 APPROVAL OF PROCUREMENT STRATEGY AND OUTLINE PROPOSAL FOR SCHEMES AT THREE PRIMARY SCHOOLS (Part 2) 25 March 2010

CAPITAL SCHEME TO ENABLE THE EXPANSION OF BICKLEY PRIMARY SCHOOL FROM 1 TO 2FE PRIMARY SCHOOL

Scheme Details

1. The project included the expansion of the school into the existing Widmore Adult Education Centre. The works included remodelling of internal space within the existing school and Widmore Centre buildings, providing lift access to overcome changes in level, new classrooms, toilet accommodation and first floor alterations to form library, music room, staff room and toilets.

Scheme History

2. The project was agreed by the Executive on 31 March 2010. Funding was provided from the Primary Capital Programme (£1,395,000), Access Initiative (£24,000) and Extended Services (£50,000).
3. The project overspent by £83,099 compared to the tender estimated cost of £1,395,000.

Project	Original Estimate	Tender Estimate	Actual Expenditure	Variance (tender estimate vs actual)
Bickley Primary School, Expansion to 2FE	£1,395,000	£1,380,005	£1,463,104	-£83,099

4. The increase in the costs related to main building contract was only £15,000, accounted for by alterations to galvanised pipework (£7,000) and addition kitchen units in classrooms (£8,000). However, other cost pressures included:
 - increases in required furniture and equipment
 - remarking of the sports hall flooring in the Widmore Centre due to impact of high level walkway on marked courts
 - accommodation moves related to the relocation of staff at the Widmore Centre and additional IT provision

Running Costs

5. Running costs for the building are met through the school's devolved budget.

Scheme Objectives

6. The objectives of the scheme were to expand the school to meet local pupil demand.

Assessment of Scheme Success

7. The scheme was successful in providing additional required pupil place in Planning Area 4.

Time scales

8. The project completed on time despite a significantly challenging programme and a range of unforeseen additional works. The Authority had no concerns regarding the contractor's performance. Any defects that were identified at the end of the Defects Liability Period have been satisfactorily resolved and signed off.

Contract Period:	42 weeks
Start Date:	02/08/10 (due to complete) 13/4/11
Practical Completion Date:	15/04/11
Over-run	2 days

**CAPITAL SCHEME TO ENABLE THE EXPANSION OF
PRINCES PLAIN PRIMARY SCHOOL FROM 1.5 TO 2FE PRIMARY SCHOOL**

Scheme Details

1. The project included the remodelling of the existing underutilised gymnasium and changing rooms to provide a small hall, two reception classrooms and an ICT classroom with associated ancillary accommodation. Changes to the layout of the site and adjacent public footpath have allowed children direct access to the existing Early Years Foundation Stage play area.

Alterations carried out to the existing building included changes to the existing layout to form a new main entrance and administration area, relocation of classrooms and staffroom to enable pairing of year groups and provision of a new platform lift to improve access to the upper floor.

Other main areas of development included a new single storey infill extension to provide a specialist music classroom and a covered link from the kitchen to the dining hall. These elements of the building are sited within existing courtyards to the rear of the school in order to minimise the visual impact on the site as the school is within designated Green Belt land.

Scheme History

3. The project was agreed by the Executive on 31 March 2010. Funding was provided from the Primary Capital Programme (£1,114,000) with the remaining provided from Section 106.
4. The project was delivered within the original project estimate but overspent by £65,825 compared to the tender estimated cost of £1,152,209.

Project	Original Estimate	Tender Estimate	Actual Expenditure	Variance (tender estimate vs actual)
Princes Plain Primary School, Expansion to 2FE	£1,363,000	£1,152,209	£1,218,034	-£65,825

5. The net increase in the construction contract cost was circa £30,000 which was predominantly due to:
- additional costs for 2 extra toilets and associated changes for reception classes due to school change
 - out of hours electrical works due to impact on school operation
 - additional tarmac works due to poor quality of surfacing to existing playground
 - draining of heating system due to lack of isolation valves
 - materials to replace mains distribution equipment due to poor state of repair

6. The project also incurred extra costs including:
- repair existing heaters in school
 - increase in IT costs
 - increase in cost of installation of mobile classrooms (carried out prior to but included in this overall project cost)

Running Costs

7. Running costs for the building are met through the school's devolved budget.

Scheme Objectives

8. The objectives of the scheme were to expand the school to meet local pupil demand.

Assessment of Scheme Success

9. The scheme was successful in providing additional required pupil place in Planning Area 5.

Time scales

10. The project completed slightly in delay. This was predominantly due to additional works required as part of the contract, the impact of working in an operative site and subsequent knock on consequences to the progress of the works and some elements taking longer than foreseen.
11. The Authority also had some concerns regarding the contractor's performance on site, predominantly issues and difficulties arising whilst working in an occupied site and control of working areas. Any defects that were identified at the end of the Defects Liability Period have been satisfactorily resolved and signed off.

Contract Period:	26 weeks (exc Christmas)
Start Date:	16/08/10 to 18/02/11
Practical Completion Date:	25/03/11 (final section)
Over-run	5 weeks

CAPITAL SCHEME TO REBUILD THE HIGHWAY PRIMARY SCHOOL

Scheme Details

1. In planning for the Primary Capital Programme The Highway Primary School was identified as the Council's highest priority primary school for 'suitability' needs due to the poor physical condition of the building.

The project rebuilt the majority of the school. The design of the new school maintained the existing three block design layout, but combined the Key Stage 1 and Key Stage 2 accommodation in one wing and designated a separate wing for a pre-school and Children and Family Centre, while retaining and refurbishing the central core.

The scheme included the creation of a new main entrance as a focal point for The Highway and incorporated improved parking facilities.

Scheme History

2. The original estimate for the project was £4,020,000 and was funded from Primary Capital Programme Capital, Children and Family Centre Grant, Early Years Capital and Planned Maintenance. An additional £650,000 has been allocated to the scheme from Basic Need Capital.
3. The scheme overspent significant against the estimated budget of £4,020,000. The Final Account was settled with Vinci at £4,749,737 with an estimated final project expenditure of £5,300,000. The extra cost had been covered by remaining Primary Capital Programme Funding and the Basic Need Contingency agreed by the Executive on 7 March 2012. The Council is currently pursuing a claim against its consultant to recoup some of these losses.

Project	Original Estimate	Tender Estimate	Actual Expenditure	Variance (tender estimate vs actual)
The Highway Primary School, Rebuild and Refurbishment	£4,020,000	£3,448,265	Circa £5,300,000	Circa -£1,850,000

4. There are 3 main reasons for the cost increases:
 - Funding condition changes imposed by Government leading to a need to re-phase works
 - Additional costs associated with asbestos removal
 - The most significant item was gaps within the contract documentation by the Authority's consultant, that led to a large number of items being added to the contract works once construction was underway. These include additional retaining walls, changes to cladding specification and additional steelwork.

Agreement of the Final Account was reached in November 2012. The overspend in relation to the third item above is still the subject of discussion between the Authority and the consultant. There is a difference of opinion on the reasons behind the changes in cost. The local authority has engaged Counsel advice to support it in seeking redress from its consultant.

Running Costs

5. Running costs for the building are met through the school's devolved budget.

Scheme Objectives

6. The objectives of the scheme were to rebuild the school to address the premise's suitability issues and provide facilities for other services to operate from the site .

Assessment of Scheme Success

7. Despite the issued encountered during the construction of the scheme the improved the projects successfully delivered the scheme school.

Time scales

8. The project completed in delay. This delay can be broken down as follows: 7 weeks due to delays associated with kitchen fit; 4 weeks due to impact of asbestos removal (large quantity); 4 weeks due to procurement issues related to the retaining wall and the remainder due to contractor delay. The Authority had no specific concerns regarding the contractor's overall performance or the quality of the final build. Any defects that were identified at the end of the Defects Liability Period have been satisfactorily resolved and signed off or are in hand with the main contractor.

Contract Period:	42 weeks
Start Date:	20/09/10
Practical Completion Date:	06/12/11
Over-run	21 weeks

CAPITAL SCHEME TO CREATE THE HAWES DOWN CENTRE

Scheme Details

1. The project converted the existing Phoenix Youth Centre accommodation that included youth service facilities and a hall used by the Glebe School into a specialist centre for children and young people with additional needs and disabilities and their families. It was designed to make better use of the Hawes Down campus, complimenting services currently provided at The Glebe and the unit provision at Hawes Down Junior School. Services and facilities provided on the site following the works include:
 - Specialist Centre including new reception, office space, adapted facilities, hygiene room and sensory room
 - Delivery of specialist short breaks
 - Improved space for nursery
 - Improvements to existing hall
 - Accommodation for the Youth Service and Duke of Edinburgh Award

Scheme History

2. The original estimate for the project was £1,518,000. The project was funded from a range of sources including Children and Family Centres Capital Grant, Co-location Grant, Short Breaks Capital Grant, Early Years Capital, Extended Services Grant, Education Planned Maintenance Grant and school contribution.
3. The final cost of the project was less than the original estimate but above the tender estimate.

Project	Original Estimate	Tender Estimate	Actual Expenditure	Variance (tender estimate vs actual)
Hawes Down Centre – Collocation Project	£1,518,000	£1,385,000	£1,498,813	- £113,813

4. The additional costs can be accounted for by a range of unforeseen works:
 - a new roof, the condition being worse than surveys suggested
 - a hot water connection between the school and the centre, which was not covered in contract but was necessary as the boiler is shared with The Glebe
 - additional data works at the client's request

Running Costs

5. The operation of the centre is overseen by a management committee chaired by The Glebe School. Revenue funding is provided by the range of services operational at the centre.

Scheme Objectives

7. The objectives of the scheme were to refurbish the existing building in order to provide a specialist environment for children with additional needs or disability and their families.

Assessment of Scheme Success

8. The project successfully adapted the facilities to provide an environment capable of delivering a range of services for children with additional needs or a disability and their families.

Time scales

9. The project completed in delay predominantly due to the impact of the necessary replacement of a very large section of the roof, which was found to be beyond repair, unfit and unsafe. This delayed progress of much of the internal works and thus the overall project. The contractor worked hard to keep part of the site in operation for much of the contract to enable the Glebe School to continue using their Sports Hall. The Authority had no concerns regarding the contractor's performance. Any defects that were identified at the end of the Defects Liability Period have been satisfactorily resolved and signed off.

Contract Period:	20 weeks (plus 2 weeks for Christmas break)
Start Date:	04/01/11
Practical Completion Date:	22/07/11
Over-run	9 weeks